

## HRAC submitters meeting: Notes & Resolutions

Austin, February 17-19, 1999

Taken and compiled by  
Konstantin Beznosov

### Agenda

1. Healthcare resource names
2. Resource naming authority
3. Admin interfaces on:
  - ADO,
  - DAS,
  - DC
4. Smart DecisionCombinator capabilities
5. Grouping of resource names
6. “multiple\_access\_allowed()” can of worms
7. Abnormal conditions handling
8. Going through all other issues and deciding what we are going to do with them.
9. Conformance levels
10. Action items, roles and responsibilities (editor, sections), submitters and supporters, presentation, mailing list responses, evaluation enabling, deciding about making the submission final.

### February 17, 1999

Attendees: John Barkley (JB), NIST; Konstantin Beznosov (KB), BHSSF; Bob Blakley, IBM; Carol Burt (CB) 2AB

### Healthcare resource names

- The submission will define healthcare resource names only for CORBAmed specifications.
- COAS resource names should be described in the COAS submission (KB to write the section)
- Future CORBAmed specs:
  - In the section which describes how we complied with the requirement on healthcare resource names, put wording saying that we are asking to change CORBAmed RFP template to add:
    - A mandatory requirement that says if the proposal specifies use of HRAC, it should specify how a compliant service generates resource names.
    - An item in evaluation criteria which says that evaluation of submissions will be based, in addition to other things, on the fact whether the submission has chosen to specify use of HRAC including definition of HRAC resource names and their spaces are defined by the submitters.
  - At the presentation, mention about this addition to future CORBAmed RFPs
- PIDS specification (KB to provide wording that describes it)
  - Resource names are defined as **write down resource name in the form provided on the whiteboard**
  - $\text{PIDS\_HRAC\_Resource\_Name} ::= \langle \text{AuthorityIdStr} \rangle + \{ \text{“QualifiedPersonId.domain”}, \text{QualifiedPersonId.domain} \} + \{ \text{“QualifiedPersonId.id”}, \text{QualifiedPersonId.id} \} + (, \{ \text{“TraitName”}, \text{TraitName} \})^+$
  - Mandatory:
    - PersonId.domain,
    - PersonId.id,
    - One or more TraitName.

## Resource naming authority

- To change ResourceName to have a structure, which contains as two members. First is a resource naming authority, second is of type ResourceNameComponentList.

## Admin interfaces on ADO, DAS, DC

- ADO – have an admin interface with two attributes that will point to policy evaluator locator and DAS. Write somewhere in the spec that implementers need to address issues whether their implementations deny/grant or raises an exception by default when abnormal conditions happen and HRAC can not recover from such conditions.
- DAS – no admin interface. We decided to have a read/write attribute on ADO admin that would allow to get/set IOR to DAS (see the paragraph on ADO admin interface). Advice to implementers section, that says that you want to make sure that DAS will give you all attributes that you need in your policy evaluators.
- TODO[JB]: to write words on relationship between DAS and policy evaluators.

## **Thursday, February 18, 1999**

Attendees: John Barkley (JB), NIST; Konstantin Beznosov (KB), BHSSF; Bob Blakley, IBM; Carol Burt (CB) 2AB, William Pope, DASCUM.

## Decision Combinator

- Pass evaluator names and ORS to DC.
- DC make “evaluate()” invocations
- PolicyEvaluatorList is a list of structs where each struct has evaluator OR and evaluator name
- These structs are used for add\_evaluators() and replace\_evaluators() on PolicyEvaluatorLocatorAdmin
- TODO[Bob Blakley]: Explain in the spec why you need evaluator names for DC.
- TODO[KB]: write up on not allowing administrators to provide a list of evaluators with two or more evaluators having the same name.

## Grouping of resource names

- Introduce the following syntax ResourceNamePattern ::= <RNAid> [, {<Name>, GRE}]<sup>+</sup> + [,{"\*", "\*"}]
- TODO[JB]: Specify a particular GRE spec.
- TODO[Bob Blakley]: Define semantics of the pattern.
- TODO[Bob Blakley]: Specify that we leave for implementors how a policy evaluator locator combines evaluators if the resource name matches more than one pattern.
- TODO[Bob Blakley]: Specify how the problem of finding out what combinator should be used in case a resource name matches more than one pattern.
- New operations on PEL admin interface:
- Persistence of PELA: not to mandate persistence in the spec.

## **Friday, February 19, 1999**

Attendees: Konstantin Beznosov (KB), BHSSF; Bob Blakley, IBM; Carol Burt (CB) 2AB.

## Conformance Levels

All interfaces are mandatory to implement in order to be HRAC-compliant.

## Name Change

- Change the submission title to “Resource Access Decision”
- Change the IDL module title to “DfResourceAccessDecision”

### multiple\_access\_allowed() “can of warms”

- Deleted PolicyEvaluator::multiple\_evaluate()

### Abnormal Conditions Handling

- ADO raises user exception “RAD\_INTERNAL” (for editor: adjust the name spelling according to the IDL style guide from the OMG) back to the ADO client when there is an internal to HRAC error that it can not recover from.
- TODO: Bob Blakley to put in the text discussion that HRAC is a subset of a reference monitor and thus should propagate exceptions to its clients who are the other part of the RM.
- TODO: Bob Burt to come up with a list of exceptions and e-mail them to the list by Monday.
- TODO: KB to define preconditions and post-conditions on HRAC operations and define corresponding exceptions.

### Going through all other issues and deciding what we are going to do with them.

Done! See the lists of resolved and outstanding issues posted to the mail list separately.

### Roles, responsibilities, and action items (editor, sections, etc.)

- CB – editor of the ms-word version of the response.
- Bob Blakley – translation from word to FM some time after 3-week rule and before the final document version is to be voted.

### Submitters and supporters

Next conference call Tuesday 2/23/99 2PM Central (3PM Eastern)

### Action items due

All action items are due 2/23 2PM Central (3PM Eastern), i.e. by the conference call

### Presentation in CORBAmed

- Bob Blakley – General presentation
- KB – COAS and PIDS and general/future CORBAmed specs

### Mailing list responses

Bob Blakley – to Kurt Schurenberg

### Evaluation enabling, deciding about making the submission final.

Another conference call for 2/26 to decide if we go with adoption vote for this meeting.

### Action items

(Compiled in one list from the items scattered over the text above)

John Barkley:

- Write words on relationship between DAS and policy evaluators.
- Specify a particular GRE spec.

Konstantin Beznosov:

- Provide UML diagrams.
- Provide section(s) on healthcare resources for the response text.
- Write up on not allowing administrators to provide a list of evaluators with two or more evaluators having the same name.

- Define preconditions and post-conditions on HRAC operations and define corresponding exceptions.

Bob Blakley:

- Explain in the spec why you need evaluator names for DC.
- Define semantics of the pattern.
- Specify that we leave for implementers how a policy evaluator locator combines evaluators if the resource name matches more than one pattern.
- Specify how the problem of finding out what combinator should be used in case a resource name matches more than one pattern.
- Provide the text discussion that HRAC is a subset of a reference monitor (RM) and thus should propagate exceptions to its clients who are the other part of the RM.
- Respond to the issues brought up by Kurt Schurenberg

Bob Burt:

- Provide exceptions.

Carol Burt:

- Provide IDL and the description of the IDL.
- Edit and post MS-Word version of the submission by March 1, 1999.